

Open Budget Survey 2015

Macedonia

Section 1. Public Availability of Budget Docs. “Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents” contains a series of four tables that allow the researcher to examine and map the public availability and dissemination of its country’s key budget documents (i.e., Pre-Budget Statement, Executive’s Budget Proposal (EBP) and Supporting EBP Documents, Citizens Budget, Enacted Budget, In-Year Reports, Mid-Year Review, Year-End Report, and Audit Report), as well as any national laws regulating budget processes and financial management. Once filled in, these tables will serve as a foundation for the completion of the rest of the questionnaire, as researchers will reference the specific documents cited in the tables to answer the questions contained in Sections 2-5 of the questionnaire.

Table 1. Key Budget Documents

Macedonia, FYR

BUDGET DOCUMENT	Full Title	Fiscal Year the Budget Document Refers to	Date of Publication
Pre-Budget Statement	Not produced	Not produced	Not produced
Executive's Budget Proposal (EBP)	Predlog budzet na RM za 2014 godina; EBP of Republic of Macedonia for 2014	2014	September 21, 2013

Supporting EBP Document	Fiskalna strategija na RM za 2014-2016	2014	September 23, 2013
Supporting EBP Document	Predlog zakon za izvršavanje na budzet za 2014	2014	September 23, 2013
Supporting EBP Document	Godishen izvestaj za upravljanje so javen dolg na RM za 2012 godina	2012	September 23, 2013
Enacted Budget	Budzet na Republika Makedonija za 2014 godina; Enacted Budget of Republic of Macedonia for 2014	2014	December 19, 2013
Citizens Budget (for EBP or Enacted Budget)	Not produced	Not produced	Not produced
In-Year Report	Budzet za RM (januari-februari); In-Year-Report for February 2014	2014	March 25, 2014
Additional in-year report	Budzet za RM -januari; In-Year-Report for January 2014	2014	March 6, 2014
Additional in-year report	Budzet za RM - Dekemvri; In-Year-Report for December 2013	2013	January 15, 2014
Mid-Year Review	Not publicly available	Not publicly available	Not publicly available
Year-End Report	Završna smetka na budzetot na RM za 2012 godina; Year-End-Report of the budget of Republic of Macedonia for 2012	2012	November 14, 2013
Audit Report	Revizorski izvestaj na Budzetot na RM za 2012 godina; Audit report of the budget of Republic of Macedonia	2012	October 24, 2013

Sources: Links to the documents 1. <http://www.sobranie.mk/ext/materialdetails.aspx?id=a2d15086-102a-43e6-be46-d66cb7554eaf>- EBP. This link is leading to other documents that are connected with the EBP (there are reports from the commissions that revised it before its promulgation). So the document that you need is written as Дополнет предлог буџетот на Република Македонија за 2014 година in pdf version. Alternative link for the EBP for 2014: http://www.esem.org.mk/pdf/Najznachajni%20vesti/2013/3/predlog-budzet_na_rm_za_2014_godina.pdf 1. <http://www.finance.gov.mk/view/budget2013>- EB. This link is leading also to the EB of 2013, the pdf tha 1. <http://www.finance.gov.mk/view/budget2013>- EB. This link is leading also to the EB of 2013, the pdf that you need is titled Буџет на Република Македонија за 2014 3. http://finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget_28_02_2014.pdf- IYR February 2014. If the above mentioned link doesn't work, than you can use this link <http://finance.gov.mk/node/898> which is leading to other IYR documents, the one to look for is titled Буџет на РМ (Јануари- Февруари) 4. http://finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget_31_01_2014_web.pdf- IYR January 2014. If the above mentioned link doesn't work, than you can use this link <http://finance.gov.mk/node/898> which is leading to other IYR documents, the one to look for is titled Буџет на РМ- Јануари 5. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget_31_12_2013_0.pdf- IYR December 2013 6. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/ZA_OBJAVUVANJE_ZAVRSNA_2012.pdf- YER 2012 7. http://www.dzr.mk/Uploads/1_Osnoven_budzet_Republika_Makedonija_KOMPLET.pdf - Audit report of the budget of Republic of Macedonia for 2012 Laws 1. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/precisten_tekst_1.pdf- Budget Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to EBP, EB, IYR, MYR and YER) 2. http://www.dzr.gov.mk/EN/Uploads/1_State%20Audit%20Law_adopted%20May%202010_ENG.pdf - State Audit Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to Audit report)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Comments: There are two issues why we have chosen the answer “no, I don't agree” and they are related with the dates when the documents were published presented by the researcher (EBP, EB and YER) and the second issue is related with the supporting documents. Namely, the supporting documents to the EBP that are publicly available were not attached in the researchers table. Although these moderation are not major in order to change them we have to choose the “no, I don't agree” answer. On the issue of the incorrect dates: 1. The date when the EBP for 2014 was published is September 23, 2013. •The Executive budget proposal for 2014 in R. Macedonia was submitted by the Government to the Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia on 21 - 22 September 2013 according to FAKTOR MK internet portal. The information is in part 5 from the news on the following link: <http://faktor.mk/archives/7331>, part 5 from the news. •On the web site of the Association ESE copies from the EBP documents were published on 23 September 2013. The documents are available on the following link: <http://esem.org.mk/index.php/najznachajni-vesti-arhiva/280>-на-собранието-на-рм-му-е-потребен-добар-план-и-распоред-да-стаса-навремено-да-одговори-на-предлозите-на-владата-на-рм-предлог-завршна-сметка,-предлог-ребаланс-на-буџет,-предлог-буџет,-фискална-стратегија-и-извештај-за-состојбата-на-јавниот-долг.html 2. The date of publishing the EB for 2014 is December 19, 2013 The date is part of the http link name: <http://finance.gov.mk/files/BUDZET%202014%20FINALNA%20VERZIJA%2019.12.2013.pdf> 3. The date of publishing the YE report is November 14, 2013. The date is available on the following link: <http://www.slvesnik.com.mk/Issues/90d4bab010df4a23ae6debf94716123.pdf> (Official Gazette of the RM no. 157, page 3) On the issue of the supporting documents of the EBP: The supporting documents to the EBP for 2014 were not provided (column 3, 4 and 5). Following supporting documents to the EBP for 2014 were submitted to the Legislator: •Fiscal strategy of RM for 2014 – 2016, published on September 23,2013. Available on the following link: <http://sobranie.mk/materialdetails.nspx?materialId=e7bc3ffe-024b-44bf-a2dd-5708c3e97486>, •Proposed Law on budget execution for 2014, published on September 23,2013. Available on the following link: <http://sobranie.mk/materialdetails.nspx?materialId=837f0bf6-f2cf-4644-9719-8a443d1f3b04> •Year report on public dept management for 2012, published on September 23,2013. Available on the following link:

<http://sobranie.mk/materialdetails.nsp?materialId=e09c27cf-84c1-43b6-82cf-5348d02cfb9b> The date of publishing the supporting documents can be confirmed through the following link: <http://esem.org.mk/index.php/najznachajni-vesti-arhiva/280>-на-собранието-на-рм-му-е-потребен-добар-план-и-распоред-да-стаса-навремено-да-одговори-на-предлозите-на-владата-на-рм-предлог-завршна-сметка,-предлог-ребаланс-на-буџет,-предлог-буџет,-фискална-стратегија-и-извештај-за-состојбата-на-јавниот-долг.html

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We double checked with the Parliament. The EBP for 2014 was submitted to the Parliament 20th of September. Thus, we accept the PR comment about the EPB and we will change the date to 21st of September for the EBP for 2014. We also agree with PR about the date of the EB and changed the date of publishing from 23 to 19th of December. We also changed the YER date because our links are not working anymore and we accept the date and link from PR to the SAO. We accept the supporting doc. Fiscal Strategy of RM for 2014-2016 and we added it to the table also the proposed Law on budget execution and the Year report on the public debt management for 2012.

Table 2a. Details about Availability

Macedonia, FYR

Budget Documents

Tick box if answer to the questions is "yes"

	Pre-Budget Statement	Executive's Budget Proposal	Enacted Budget	Citizens Budget
Is it produced at all?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it produced for internal purposes only?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it published too late compared to the accepted timeframe?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, with charge?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, NO charge?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in soft copy, with charge?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in soft copy, NO charge?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No

Is it available to the public online?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
If available online, provide internet/URL address	N/A	http://www.sobranie.mk/ext/materialdetails.aspx?id=b3fe9d86-6929-477c-86d1-58325470a3fb	http://www.finance.gov.mk/view/budget2013	N/A
Is it machine readable? [only for electronic copies]	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is there a "citizens version" of the budget document?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	N/A

Sources: Links to the documents 1. <http://www.sobranie.mk/ext/materialdetails.aspx?id=a2d15086-102a-43e6-be46-d66cb7554eaf>- EBP. This link is leading to other documents that are connected with the EBP (there are reports from the commissions that revised it before its promulgation). So the document that you need is written as Дополнет предлог буџетот на Република Македонија за 2014 година in pdf version. Alternative link for the EBP for 2014: http://www.esem.org.mk/pdf/Najznachajni%20vesti/2013/3/predlog-budzet_na_rm_za_2014_godina.pdf 1. <http://www.finance.gov.mk/view/budget2013>- EB. This link is leading also to the EB of 2013, the pdf that you need is titled Буџет на Република Македонија за 2014 Laws 1. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/precisten_tekst_1.pdf - Budget Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to EBP, EB, IYR, MYR and YER) 2. http://www.dzr.gov.mk/EN/Uploads/1_State%20Audit%20Law_adopted%20May%202010_ENG.pdf - State Audit Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to Audit report) The Pre- budget statement and the Citizen's budget are not produced in Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Comments: There are two issues related with the chosen answer on our side. The first one is related with the URL addresses of the EBP and EB presented by the researcher and the second one refers to the availability of the Citizens budget to the public in a soft copy with charge. In relation to the first issue, the URL addresses provided by the researcher are not leading to the specific document- EBP (leads to the General Assembly site where all EBP documents are published) and EB (leads to the Ministry of Finance site where a list of all budget related documents referring to 2013 is presented). 1. The specific URL address for the EBP is the following: <http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf> 2.The specific URL address for the EB is the following: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/BUDZET%202014%20FINALNA%20VERZIJA%2019.12.2013.pdf> On the issues of the CB availability i.e. the answer to the question "Is it available to the public in soft copy, with charge?" should be "NO", since this type of document is not produced at all.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We agree on the Citizen budget. it should be: NO. Given the PR comment we changed the answer to the Q: Is it available to the public in soft copy, with charge? to NO our links can be replaced with the links provided by the PR.

Table 2b. Details about Availability

Macedonia, FYR

Budget Documents

Tick box if answer to the questions is “yes”

	In-Year Report	Mid-Year Review	Year-End Report	Audit Report
Is it produced at all?	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No
Is it produced for internal purposes only?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it published too late compared to the accepted timeframe?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, with charge?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, NO charge?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in soft copy, with charge?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public in soft copy, NO charge?	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No
Is it available to the public online?	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No
If available online, provide internet/URL address	http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/898	N/A	http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/575	http://dzt.mk/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=0&tabid=1090
Is it machine readable? [only for electronic copies]	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Is there a “citizens version” of the budget document?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No

Sources: 1. http://finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget_28_02_2014.pdf- IYR February 2014. If the above mentioned link doesn't work, than you can use this link <http://finance.gov.mk/node/898> which is leading to other IYR documents, the one to look for is titled Бюџет на РМ (Јануари- Февруари) 2. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/ZA_OBJAVUVANJE_ZAVRSNA_2012.pdf- YER 2012 3. http://www.dzr.mk/Uploads/1_Osnoven_budzet_Republika_Makedonija_KOMPLET.pdf - Audit report of the budget of Republic of Macedonia for 2012 Laws 1. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u10/Budget_law_cleared_version_20042010_0.pdf - Budget Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to EBP, EB, IYR, MYR and YER) 2. http://www.dzr.gov.mk/EN/Uploads/1_State%20Audit%20Law_adopcted%20May%202010_ENG.pdf - State Audit Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to Audit report) The Mid-Year-Report is not publicly available.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Comments: In this table the provided URL addresses for the bellow presented documents are not leading to the specific documents (it leads to the site where all documents related to these questions are published). Following links should be used in order to reach the specific documents: 1. The specific URL addresses for the In Year Reports documents are:

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget2013.pdf> http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget%2031.08_web.pdf 2.

The specific URL address for the Year - End Report for 2012 is:

http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/ZA_OBJAVUVANJE_ZAVRSNA_2012.pdf 3. The specific URL address for the Audit Report for 2012 is: http://www.dzr.mk/Uploads/1_Osnoven_budzet_Republika_Makedonija_KOMPLET.pdf

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We agree our links to be replaced with the links provided by the PR.

Table 3. When Are the Key Budget Documents Made Available to the Public?

Macedonia, FYR

Pre-Budget Statement: When is the Pre-Budget Statement made available to the public?

- 100. At least four months in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the executive's budget proposal is introduced in the legislature
- 67. At least two months, but less than four months, in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the executive's budget proposal is introduced in the legislature
- 33. Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least one month before the executive's budget proposal is introduced in the legislature
- 0. Does not release to the public, or is released less than one month before the executive's budget proposal is introduced to the legislature

Executive Budget Proposal: When is the Executive Budget Proposal made available to the public?

- 100. At least three months in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- 67. At least two months, but less than three months, in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- 33. Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the

legislature

0. Does not release to the public, or is released after the budget has been approved by the legislature

Enacted Budget: When is the Enacted Budget made available to the public?

100. Two weeks or less after the budget has been enacted

67. Between two weeks and six weeks after the budget has been enacted

33. More than six weeks, but less than three months, after the budget has been enacted

0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than three months after the budget has been enacted

In-Year Report: When are In-Year Reports made available to the public?

100. At least every month, and within one month of the period covered

67. At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered

33. At least semi-annually, and within three months of the period covered

0. Does not release to the public

Mid-Year Review: How long after the mid-point in the fiscal year

(i.e., six months into the fiscal year) is the Mid-Year Review made available to the public?

100. Six weeks or less after the mid-point

67. Nine weeks or less, but more than six weeks, after the mid-point

33. More than nine weeks, but less than three months, after the mid-point

0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than three months after the mid-point

Year-End Report: How long after the end of the budget year is the Year-End Report made available to the public?

100. Six months or less after the end of the budget year

67. Nine months or less, but more than 6 months, after the end of the budget year

33. More than nine months, but within 12 months, after the end of the budget year

0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

Audit Report: How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual

expenditures of national departments audited and released (except for secret programs)?

100. Six months or less after the end of the budget year

67. 12 months or less, but more than 6 months, after the end of the budget year

33. More than 12 months, but within 18 months, after the end of the budget year

0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than 18 months after the end of the budget year

Sources: Links to the documents 1. <http://www.sobranie.mk/ext/materialdetails.aspx?Id=a2d15086-102a-43e6-be46-d66cb7554eaf>- EBP. This link is leading to other documents that are connected with the EBP (there are reports from the commissions that revised it before its promulgation). So the document that you need is written as Дополнет предлог буџетот на Република Македонија за 2014 година in pdf version. Alternative link for the EBP for 2014: http://www.esem.org.mk/pdf/Najznachajni%20vesti/2013/3/predlog-budzet_na_rm_za_2014_godina.pdf 1. <http://www.finance.gov.mk/view/budget2013>- EB. This link is leading also to the EB of 2013, the pdf that you need is titled Буџет на Република Македонија за 2014 3. http://finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget_28_02_2014.pdf- IYR February 2014. If

the above mentioned link doesn't work, than you can use this link <http://finance.gov.mk/node/898> which is leading to other IYR documents, the one to look for is titled Буџет на РМ (Јануари- Февруари) 4. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/ZA_OBJAVUVANJE_ZAVRSNA_2012.pdf- YER 2012 5. http://www.dzr.mk/Uploads/1_Osnoven_budzet_Republika_Makedonija_KOMPLET.pdf - Audit report of the budget of Republic of Macedonia for 2012 Laws 1. http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u10/Budget_law_cleared_version_20042010_0.pdf - Budget Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to EBP, EB, IYR, MYR and YER) 2. http://www.dzr.gov.mk/EN/Uploads/1_State%20Audit%20Law_adopted%20May%202010_ENG.pdf - State Audit Law- Republic of Macedonia (referring to Audit report)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Comments: In this table we don't agree with the answer related to the question "When is the Enacted Budget made available to the public?". The EBP was publicly available at least three months in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature (September 23, 2013). This answer can be supported by the information available on following links: •The Executive budget proposal for 2014 in R. Macedonia was submitted by the Government to the Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia on 21 - 22 September 2013 according to FAKTOR MK internet portal. The information is in part 5 from the news on the following link: <http://faktor.mk/archives/7331>, part 5 from the news. •On the web site of the Association ESE copies from the EBP documents were published on 23 September 2013. The documents are available on the following link: <http://esem.org.mk/index.php/najznachajni-vesti-arhiva/280-на-собранието-на-рм-му-е-потребен-добар-план-и-распоред-да-стаса-навремено-да-одговори-на-предлозите-на-владата-на-рм-предлог-завршна-сметка,-предлог-ребаланс-на-буџет,-предлог-буџет,-фискална-стратегија-и-извештај-за-состојбата-на-јавниот-долг.html>

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We changed the answer for the EBP to: "At least three months in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature".

Table 4. General Questions

Macedonia, FYR

	YES/NO	If yes, additional information; If no, please note N/A in the text box.
Is there a website or web portal for government fiscal information?	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Yes <input type="radio"/> No	http://www.sobranie.mk/materijali.nspk http://finance.gov.mk/node/849 http://finance.gov.mk/node/898 http://finance.gov.mk/node/852 http://www.dzr.mk/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=0&tabid=109

Is there a law (or laws) guiding public financial management?

- Yes
 No

http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u10/Budget_law_cleared_version_20042010_0.pdf
http://www.dzr.gov.mk/EN/Uploads/1_State%20Audit%20Law_adopted%20May%202010_EN_G.pdf

Are there additional laws regulating:

- Access to information?
- Transparency?
- Citizens participation?

- Yes
 No

http://www.stat.gov.mk/pdf/SlobodenPristapDoInformacii/zakon_za_informacii.pdf - Law on Free Access to Public Information
http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u10/Budget_law_cleared_version_20042010_0.pdf - Law for transparency regulation (article 3)

Sources: 1. <http://www.sobranie.mk> (this is the more detailed link that leads to the documents - <http://www.sobranie.mk/materijali.nspj>) - Here are published the Executive's Budget Proposals 2. <http://www.finance.gov.mk> (this is the more detailed link that leads to the documents - <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/849>) - Here are published the Enacted Budgets, In-Year-Reports, Year-End-Reports - <http://finance.gov.mk/view/budget2013> - EBs (<http://finance.gov.mk/files/BUDZET%202014%20FINALNA%20VERZIJA%2019.12.2013.pdf> EB for 2014) - <http://finance.gov.mk/node/575> - YERs (http://finance.gov.mk/files/u6/ZA_OBJAVUVANJE_ZAVRSNA_2012.pdf - YER for 2012) - <http://finance.gov.mk/node/898> - IYRs (http://finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget_28_02_2014.pdf - IYR for February 2014) 3. <http://dzr.mk> (this is the more detailed link that leads to the documents - <http://www.dzr.mk/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=0&tabid=1090>) - Here are published the Audit reports of the Government and government institutions

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: In Table 4 the researcher has mentioned only four sources (Ministry of Finance, General Assembly, State Statistic Office and State audit office official web sites), while there are many other related relevant source where the above mentioned documents can be found. Following are the links where these documents can be found too: 1. Web sites and web portals where government fiscal information can be found: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/575> <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/60> <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/400> <http://dzr.mk/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=0&tabid=1092> <http://www.otvorenipodatoci.gov.mk/Templates/Pages/OpenDataPage.aspx?page=40> <http://slvesnik.com.mk/besplatni-izdanija.nspj> <http://nbrm.mk/?ItemID=2206B6DB874F3C4A935C68C54003A7C0> <http://www.stat.gov.mk/> 2. The public financial management legislation is consisted of laws related to specific financial management area and other individual laws, as specified bellow: - laws on taxes and other public revenues available at : <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/187> - laws regulating customs available at: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/188> - laws

on public sector accounting available at: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/189> - laws on budget execution available at: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/186> - laws on Borrowing Abroad available at: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/191> - laws on public debt management available at: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/929> and - other laws available at: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/node/679> - State Audit Law available at : <http://dzt.mk/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=0&tabid=1074> - Law on Public Procurement available at: <http://bjn.gov.mk/bjn-portal/wordpress/?docs=law-on-public-procurement> - Budget Law available at: <http://www.slvesnik.com.mk/Issues/6AB93026F74BA3488113E5A39FE334CC.pdf>, and updated version on <http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/5.pdf> etc. 3. Laws on access to information, transparency and citizens participation are as follows: - Law on Free Access to Public Information available at: <http://komspi.mk/DokumentiDetails.aspx?lang=1&itemID=1> - Law on Referendum and other Forms of Direct Expression of Citizens available at: <http://www.slvesnik.com.mk/Issues/2D32962661205643872038D09BA69B54.pdf> and - Law on Use of Public Sector Data available at: https://ener.gov.mk/Default.aspx?item=pub_regulation&subitem=view&itemid=TTyjU9aZOY1Y3pXenME4Og==&type=1.

Section 2. Comprehensiveness of the Executive's Budget Proposal

001. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

- A. Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- B. Yes, administrative units accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- C. Yes, administrative units accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- D. No, expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Central budget expenditures by budget users (Биланс на расходи на централен буџет по буџетски корисници) Pages 73,74,75 and 76

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Central budget expenditures by budget users (Биланс на расходи на Централен буџет по буџетски корисници) page: 69, 70 and 71 <http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf>

002. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

- A. Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.
- B. No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Budget expenditures by function of Central budget (Буџетски расходи по функции на Централен буџет) Pages 77,78 and 79

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Budget expenditures by functions of the Central budget (Биланс на расходи по функции на Централен буџет) page 72, 73 and 74 <http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf>

003. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?

- A. Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.
- B. No, the functional classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by functional classification.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Budget expenditures by function of Central budget (Буџетски расходи по функција на Централен Буџет) Pages 77,78 and 79

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Budget expenditures by functions of the Central budget (Биланс на расходи по функции на Централен буџет) page 72, 73 and 74 <http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf>

004. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

- A.** Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.
- B.** No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification.
- C.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 100

Sources: Expenditures of the Budget of Republic of Macedonia by items (Биланс на расходи на Буџетот на Република Македонија по ставки) Pages 66 and 67

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

005. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

- A.** Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.
- B.** No, the economic classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by economic classification.
- C.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 100

Sources: Expenditures of the Budget of Republic of Macedonia by items (Биланс на расходи на Буџетот на Република Македонија по ставки) Pages 66 and 67

Comments: The capital and the current expenditures to Units of Local Self-government are disaggregated in two separate lines.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

006. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

- A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- D. No, expenditures are not presented by program.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 100

Sources: Pages 80-81 in the EBP for Republic of Macedonia for 2014

Comments: The Executive's Budget Proposal presents expenditures on a program level, i.e., expenditures are presented with a level of detail below administrative unit.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: a.

Comments: The individual programs of the budget year are presented on page 75 and 76 in the EBP for 2014. Also, there are other programs as those listed on page 75 and 76 (Governmental programs only). These programs are shown in the separate part of the Central budget under each administrative unit budget (ministry budget) on pages 86 - 304. Practically,

at the beginning of each ministry budget the first line items are dedicated to the programs (as listed below). The EBP is available at: <http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf> The list of Programs per ministry: - page 86, item 1 and 2 - page 88, item 1 and 2 - page 90, item 2 - page 92, item 2 - page 94, item 2 - page 95, item 2 - page 97, item 2 - page 98, item 2 - page 100, item 2 - page 102, item 2 - page 104, item 2 - page 106, item 2 - page 108, item 2 - page 109, item 1 - page 110, item 2 - page 112, item 1 - page 113, item 2 - page 115, items 1, 2 and Д - page 118, items 1, 2 and 3 - page 121, item 2 - page 123, item 2 - page 125, item 2 - page 127, items 2, 3, 5, 6 and M - page 130, items 2 and K - page 132, item 2 - page 133, item 2 - page 135, item 1 - page 136, items 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, B and K - page 141, item 1 and 2 - page 143, item 2 and M - page 145, item 2 and K - page 147, items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, A, Г and M - page 153, items 1, 3, Г and K - page 156, items 2 and 3 - page 159, item 2 - page 161, items 1, 2, 3, 4 and K - page 164, items 1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9 and M - page 169, items 2, 3, A and M - page 173, items 2 and M - page 176, item 2 - page 178, items 2 and M - page 180, item 2 - page 181, item 2 - page 184, items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 Д and M - page 193, items 2 and Д - page 195, item 2 - page 197, items 2 and Д - page 199, item 2 - page 201, items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and C - page 206, items 1, 2, 3, Д and K - page 211, items 1, 2, 3, 5, 6 and M - page 219, items 1, 2 and 3 - page 221, items 1, 2, 3, 4, and K - page 224, items 1, 2 and M - page 226, items 1, 2, 3 and M - page 228, items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, A, Б, Г, K and M - page 236, items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, Д, K, M and T - page 248, items 1, 2, 3 and 4 - page 252, item 2 - page 254, items 2, 3 and 4 - page 256, items 2, 3, 4 and H - page 259, items 1, 2, K and M - page 262, items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 and A - page 270, items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 and K - page 279, items 1, 2, 4, M and O - page 282, item 2 - page 283, item 2 - page 284, item 2 - page 285, items 1, 2, 3 and K - page 288, items 1, 2 and M - page 290, items 1 and 2 - page 292, item 2 - page 294, item 1 - page 296, items 1 and O - page 298, items 2 and 3 - page 300, items 2 and 3 - page 303, item 2

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

Given the definition in the IBP Guidelines as of what presentation will be taken as eligible as of individual program, we agree with the PR and we will change the answer to "a". But note that Macedonia do not have program budgeting. At the moment Ministry of finance is asking EU to help with a twining project so that Macedonia "can implement program budgeting".

007. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- A.** Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- B.** Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- C.** Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- D.** No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 33

Sources: Multi-year expenditure estimates by administrative classification (Преглед на развојни потпрограми) Pages 82-90

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

008. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

- A.** Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- B.** Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- C.** Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- D.** No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Pages 82-90 in the EBP for 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

009. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

- A.** Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented.
- B.** Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are presented.
- C.** Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are presented.

D. No, individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Page 65 of the EBP

Comments: Данок од доход, од добивка и од капитални добивки is at least three if not more individual taxes. Домашни даноци на стоки и услуги is at least 2 individual taxes. This is why the answer is B.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: Guidelines for public revenues classifications, page 2 - 7:

http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/Pravilnik_za_klasifikacija_na_prihodite.pdf Page 64 in the EBP for 2014 (Central budget revenues). The tax revenues are not disaggregated in the budget. The Tax revenues are presented in 4 cumulative accounts: 711, 714, 715 and 718. These accounts are consisted of different tax revenues. For example: account item 711 named as: Taxes from income, profit and capital gains include two types of taxes i.e. income tax (7111) and profit tax (7112), which are not presented in the budget. The EBP is available at: <http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf>

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

Revenues could be further disaggregated but when we compare the level of detail to other countries it merits a B answer (in coordination with IBP).

010. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

A. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.

B. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are presented.

C. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues are presented.

D. No, individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Page 65 of the EBP

Comments: Глоби, судски и административни такси, Такси и надоместоци among other non-tax revenue needs to be further disaggregated. This is why B is the answer.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: Guidelines for public revenues classifications, page 7 - 10:

http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/Pravilnik_za_klasifikacija_na_prihodite.pdf The non - tax revenues are not disaggregated in the budget. The Non tax revenues are presented in 5 cumulative accounts: 721, 722, 723, 724 and 725. These accounts are consisting different non-tax revenues. For example: account item 721 named as: entrepreneurial income and property income include three types of non-tax revenues, such as: Profit form additional activities of the governmental agencies (7211); revenues form public financial and non-financial institutions (7212) and other property revenues (7213), which are not presented in the budget. EBP for 2014, page 64.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

Revenues could be further disaggregated but when we compare the level of detail to other countries it merits a B answer (in coordination with IBP).

011. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- A. Yes, multi-year estimates of revenue are presented by category.
- B. No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.
- C. Not applicable/other (please

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: There are no multi-year estimates for the revenues in the EBP. The revenues are shown on page 65 of the EBP for 2014, but without estimates.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: EBP page 64 (The Central budget revenues). The EBP is available at:

<http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf> .

012. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- A.** Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.
- B.** Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented.
- C.** Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of revenue are presented.
- D.** No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: There are no multi-year estimates for the revenues in the EBP. The revenues are shown on page 65 of the EBP for 2014, but without estimates.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: EBP page 64 (The Central budget revenues). The EBP is available at:

<http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf>

013. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: On page 65 of the EBP for 2014 are presented the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year under lines 75 and 76 (Revenues of Central budget by items) On page 66 of the EBP for 2014 are presented the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year under line 45 (Expenditures of Central budget by items)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: a.

Comments: The information provided by the researcher in the comment section do not refer to the EBP for 2014. The researcher uses the EBP for 2014 with all the amendments from the legislator included. Therefore the information related to the net new borrowing required during the budget year could be find on the in the Revenue statement of RM Central budget by items in the EBP for 2014 presented on page 64, item 75 (internal/domestic borrowings) and item 76 (external borrowings). While the information related to the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year could be find in the Expenditure statement of RM Central budget by items in the EBP for 2014 presented on page 67, item 45.

014. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D. No, information related to composition of total debt outstanding is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 33

Sources: The only information that is presented in the EBP for 2014 is the separation of the debt as domestic and external (lines 75 and 76 on page 65) and the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors (line 45 on page 66)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: a.

Comments: The information provided by the researcher in the comment section do not refer to the EBP for 2014. The researcher uses the EBP for 2014 with all the amendments from the legislator included. The information related to one of the core elements "weather the debt is domestic of external" could be find on the in the Revenue statement of RM Central budget by items in the EBP for 2014 presented on page 64, item 75 (internal/domestic borrowings) and item 76 (external borrowings).

015. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 33

Sources: EBP of Republic of Macedonia contains forecast only for the nominal GDP level (page 1) and the inflation rate (page 2).

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The inflation rate estimations are presented on page 2 in the last paragraph. This part is named as "macroeconomic projections". The nominal GDP level; real GDP growth and the interest rates are not presented in this part or any other part of the proposal. Few information on some GDP elements (net export, consumption and investments) are contained under paragraph 2 and 3, page 2 of the EBP. The EBP is available at: <http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t=pdf>

016. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget? (The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- A.** Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
- B.** Yes, the core information is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
- C.** Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D.** No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: There is no sensitivity analysis, so no information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is presented.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

017. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

- A.** Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

- B.** Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect expenditure is presented.
- D.** No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: The information are shown in the EBP for 2014 on pages 5-8

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: The EBP does not contain description on how the new policy proposals will affect the next year budget expenditures. Even more in the Macedonian budget process there is no discussions on how the new governmental policies will affect the expenditures. In the budget document, there is description/ explanation of the continuation of some of the excising policies (for instance the employment and social insurance policies), as well as general overview on the most important parts of the budget. We may also add that almost each newly adopted law does not contain financial implication for its implementation.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We agree that there is no proper RIA and/or estimates done on all new policy proposals but there are information (not analysis) showing how new policy proposals will affect expenditures presented and that is why we stay at answer: "c."

018. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

- A.** Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B.** Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.
- D.** No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect revenues is not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 33

Sources: The information are shown in the EBP for 2014 on pages 4-5

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: The EBP does not contain description on how the new policy proposals will affect the next year budget revenues. Even more in the Macedonian budget process there is no discussions on how the new governmental policies will affect the revenues. In the budget document, there is description/ explanation of the continuation of some of the excising policies (for instance the employment and social insurance policies) and the newly proposed ones, as well as general overview on the most important parts of the budget without any further explanation or sensitive/scenario analysis. We may also add that almost each newly adopted law, does not contain financial implication for its implementation.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

There is lack of RIA and other types of analysis but there are information available showing how some (not all) policy proposals will affect revenues. We retain our answer C.

019. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- A.** Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- B.** Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- C.** Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- D.** No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 67

Sources: Economic classification on pages 66-67 Administrative classification on pages 73-76

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Economic classification on pages 67-68 Administrative classification on pages 69-71

020. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- D. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: In the Macedonian Central budget, the budgets of the administrative users are presented by programs, while detailed segregation of the expenditures under each of the programs is used in 2014. The EBP budget table contains column for BY-1, but this column is blank for the programs. Only the total expenditures are presented for BY-1 under each budget user.

021. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

- A. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.
- B. No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: Expenditures are present for the whole year 2013 (BY-1) in the EBP of Republic of Macedonia for 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: a.

022. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- A.** Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- B.** Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- C.** Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- D.** No, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The EBP contains only expenditures for BY-1

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

023. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

-
- A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
 - B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
 - C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
 - D. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Expenditures are not presented by program for BY-2 and prior years

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

024. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

- A. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- B. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- C. Before BY-3.
- D. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: In the EBP no actual outcomes from the expenditures are presented.

025. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- A. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.
- B. No, revenue estimates for BY-1 are not presented by category.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Page 65 of the EBP for 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The revenue estimates by categories for BY-1 are presented on page 64 in the EBP i.e. column 1 from the Revenue statement of the Central budget by items.

026. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- A. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1.
- B. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue for BY-1 are presented.
- C. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues for BY-1 are presented.
- D. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-1.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: This is shown on page 65 of the EBP for 2014

Comments: Данок од доход, од добивка и од капитални добивки is at least three if not more individual taxes. Домашни даноци на стоки и услуги is at least 2 individual taxes. Глоби, судски и административни такси, Такси и надоместоци among other non-tax revenue needs to be further disaggregated. This is why B is the answer.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: Guidelines for public revenues classifications, page 2 - 7:

http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/Pravilnik_za_klasifikacija_na_prihodite.pdf Page 64 in the EBP for 2014 (Central budget revenues). The tax revenues are not disaggregated in the budget. The Tax revenues are presented in 4 cumulative accounts: 711, 714, 715 and 718. This accounts consists different tax revenues inside. For example: account item 711 named as: Taxes from income, profit and capital gains include two types of taxes, such as: income tax (7111) and Profit tax (7112), which are not presented in the budget. EBP for 2014, page 61 - (Central budget revenues plus Social security contributions). The same explanation as in the paragraph above, plus one cumulative account: 712.

<http://sobranie.mk/downloaddocument.aspx?id=59c58877-db40-4653-a508-926f7999ad71&t>

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

Revenues could be further disaggregated but when we compare the level of detail to other countries it merits a B answer (in coordination with IBP).

027. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

- A. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.
- B. No, revenue estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: Revenues are present for the whole year 2013 (BY-1) in the EBP of Republic of Macedonia 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: a.

028. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- A. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by category.
- B. No, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by category.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: Revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by category in the EBP

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

029. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- A. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- B. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- C. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- D. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years in the EBP.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

030. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

- A. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- B. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- C. Before BY-3.
- D. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

031. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year proceeding the budget year (BY-1)? (The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for government debt.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for government debt.

- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D. No, information related to government debt is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: The only information available in the EBP are: amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1 (page 65) interest payments on the debt (page 66) whether it is domestic or external debt (page 65)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: a.

Comments: The pages indicated in the researcher comments are not leading to the needed data, neither are precising the budget line items related to this question. Following are the pages and budget line items included in the EBP for 2014 that can be used for the purposes of responding to this question: - amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; page 64, item 75 (domestic debt, including sub items 751 and 753,) and item 76 (external debt, including sub items 761 and 762) - interest payments on the debt, page 67, item 45 (including sub items 451, 452 and 453) - whether it is domestic or external debt, page 64, item 75 (domestic debt, including sub items 751 and 753,) and 76 (external debt, including sub items 761 and 762)

032. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

- A. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- B. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- C. Before BY-3.
- D. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

033. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some extra-budgetary funds.
- D. No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: The Executive's Budget Proposal presents information for: Health Insurance Fund (pages 60 and 346-349), Pension and Disability Insurance Fund of Macedonia (Pages 61 and 354-357) and Employment Service Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (pages 60 and 350 - 353).

Comments: Beyond the core elements are presented the priorities and goals of the extra- budgetary fund and the output indicator of the extra- budgetary funds.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: The Executive's Budget Proposal does not contain policy rationale or statement of purpose for the extra budgetary funds i.e. Health Insurance Fund (pages 55, 56 and 305-308); Pension and Disability Insurance Fund (pages 57 and 313-316) and Employment Service Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (pages 56 and 309-312).

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

Beyond the core elements are presented the priorities and goals of the extra- budgetary fund and the output indicator of the extra- budgetary funds. we stay for "a"

034. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

- A. Yes, central government finances are presented on a consolidated basis.
- B. No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: Central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis in the EBP for 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

035. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?

- A. Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B. Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C. Yes, estimates of some but not all intergovernmental transfers are presented.
- D. No, estimates of intergovernmental transfers are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: The transfers from the central government to other levels of government are on pages 66 (line 44. More detailed this is shown on pages 62-63) and 71 (lines 43 and 44) of the EBP for 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: b.

Comments: The transfers from the central government to other levels of government are presented on cumulative basis (there is no segregation by the cumulative sub items under each cumulative items) on pages 58 and 59; page 62 (account 44 i 46) and page 67 (account 43,44 and 46) in the EBP for 2014. From the data presented it's impossible to determine whether the transfers are made for all cumulative sub items or for some of them. There is also no narrative description.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

The transfers from the central government to other levels of government are on pages 66 (line 44. More detailed this is shown on pages 62-63) and 71 (lines 43 and 44) of the EBP for 2014. we stay for answer "c"

036. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?

- A.** Yes, at least three alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- B.** Yes, two alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- C.** Yes, one alternative display of expenditures is presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- D.** No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 0

Sources: There are no alternative displays of expenditures that should be presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens in the EBP for 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

037. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?

- A. Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B. Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C. Yes, estimates of some but not all transfers to public corporations are presented.
- D. No, estimates of transfers to public corporations are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: The transfers to public corporations is presented on page 66 (line 461) and 71 (line 461) of the EBP for 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Only the subsidies from the Central Budget to the public corporations are presented in the EBP. These information are available at page 67 (item 461) from the EBP.

038. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some quasi-fiscal activities.
- D. No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented in the EBP of 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

039. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all financial assets.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for all financial assets.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some financial assets.
- D. No, information related to financial assets is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Page 62, line 485 in the EBP of 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: The EBP presents only the value of the total financial assets, without presenting the listing of the individual financial assets and their individual value. Page 68, item 485.

040. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all nonfinancial assets.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for all nonfinancial assets.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some nonfinancial assets.
- D. No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: In the EBP of 2014 are presented only the revenues from the non-financial assets. This is on pages 65 and 68 (line 721)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: d.

041. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?

- A. Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B. Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C. Yes, estimates of some but not all expenditure arrears are presented.
- D. No, estimates of expenditure arrears are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: There are no such estimates in the EBP of 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

042. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all contingent liabilities.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for all contingent liabilities.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some contingent liabilities.
- D. No, information related to contingent liabilities is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Information related to contingent liabilities is not presented in the EBP of 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

043. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term? (The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D. No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: This is shown on page 5 of the EBP for 2014 and is referring to the pension system in the country

Comments: The Executive's Budget Proposal presents only the information that the future impact on the budget of these liabilities is taken into consideration through increasing the level of planned expenditures, but it lacks details of the estimates made.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: d.

044. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

- A. Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B. Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C. Yes, estimates of some but not all sources of donor assistance are presented.
- D. No, estimates of the sources of donor assistance are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Estimates of the sources of donor assistance are not presented in the EBP of 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

045. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all tax expenditures.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for all tax expenditures.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some tax expenditures.
- D. No, information related to tax expenditures is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: There are no information on tax expenditures in the EBP for 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

046. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues?

- A. Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B. Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C. Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.
- D. No, estimates of earmarked revenues are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Estimates on earmarked revenues are not presented in the EBP of 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

047. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?

A. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for the budget year is presented.

D. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for the budget year is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: In the Executive's Budget Proposal some output indicators by administrative units are presented, but in a very general form (pages 14-61 in the EBP for 2014)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: a.

Comments: The information is presented in the EBP for 2014, page 317 - 375 (development part of the budget).

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

we stay for the answer: "c"

048. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

- A.** Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B.** Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for a multi-year period is presented.
- D.** No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: These information are shown on pages from 358 to 416 in the EBP for 2014

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: This information is shown on pages from 317 to 375 in the EBP for 2014

049. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

- A.** Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
- B.** Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or

any) programs.

- C.** Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
- D.** No, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: This is shown on pages 14-61 of the EBP for 2014

Comments: Индикатор (Indicator) is the input information and they are showing the number of employees and operating expenditure per employee. The link between the employees and the inputs needed to achieve the goal are shown in the text before the Indicator

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: This is shown on pages 14-57 of the EBP for 2014. But the only resource used to measure the results is the number of employees and operating expenditures per employee. No other input indicators are used. Therefore we can not say that based on this indicators we can draw a clear picture on what resources are used and moreover how effective they are used.

050. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

- A.** Yes, nonfinancial data on results are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
- B.** Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.
- C.** Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
- D.** No, nonfinancial data on results are not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: This is shown on pages 14-61 of the EBP for 2014.

Comments: The output indicators (Аутпут индикатор) range from visits, to documents produced and training held.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The output indicators are presented on pages 14 - 57 in the EBP for 2014. But, the output indicators are too general and should be further improved. Following are some examples of the output indicators used in EBP: number of international visits made by the President of the Republic and number of returned visits made by heads of the state; number of hours spent on Parliamentary sessions held; number of audits conducted ; etc.

051. Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?

- A.** Yes, performance targets are assigned to all nonfinancial data on results.
- B.** Yes, performance targets are assigned to most nonfinancial data on results.
- C.** Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.
- D.** No, performance targets are not assigned to nonfinancial data on results, or the budget does not present nonfinancial data on results.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Performance targets are not assigned to non- financial data on results

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

052. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

- A.** Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B.** Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, estimates of some but not all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented.
- D.** No, estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 33

Sources: The estimates of some of the policies are shown on pages 9-13 of the EBP for 2014

Comments: Presented are policies for reducing poverty by increasing the employment through implementation of the Operational Plan for active employment measures.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: In the Central budget of RM the estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are included as a part of the general accounts in the budget and are not presented separately. This estimates can't be determinate in the budget document.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We stay to our answer "c". There are estimates. For example: Program B-Measures for decreasing poverty with subprogram BA-Employment incentives page 75 at budget proposal for 2014 from September 2013. Also: page 10 clearly explains that program B is about decreasing poverty.

053. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

- A. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
- B. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
- C. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
- D. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: The timetable is released on the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of Republic of Macedonia on the following link: <http://finance.gov.mk/node/949> . The link contains Guidelines for filling the budget circular, Tables for filling the budget circular and Entrance in the application for filling the Budget Circular. The Budget Circular is actually instructions for submission of application from the government entities for the preparation of the Budget Proposal. Also, the timetables with deadlines for submissions from other government entities to Ministry of Finance are listed in the Budget Law of Republic of Macedonia (pages 10-14, articles: 19-28)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: There is no publicly available timetable with precise deadlines for each step from EBP formulation and for ensuring civil society engagement when necessary. .

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We stay to our answer under "b". In the Budget law (we give link to it in attachments) there are precise deadlines for elements of the budget process also, in the budget circular there are instructions. The PR is right in saying that there is no formal regulation ensuring CSO engagement. That is why we choose "b".

Section 3. Comprehensiveness of Other Key Budget Documents

054. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

- B.** Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- C.** Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D.** No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

055. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

- A.** Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.
- B.** Yes, the core information is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.
- C.** Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D.** No, information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

056. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D. No, information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

057. Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

058. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- A. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented.
- B. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

059. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- B. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- C. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- D. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 100

Sources: The administrative classification is shown on pages 73-76 The economic classification on expenditures is shown on pages 71 and 72 The functional classification on expenditures is shown on pages 77-79

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

060. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- B. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- C. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- D. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 100

Sources: The expenditure estimates for individual programs are shown on pages 80-90

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The Budget of each administrative units is broken down in subgroups (programs). The Governmental programs of the Central budget are presented on page 80 and 81. Mid term Development programs by users are presented on page 82-90 in the EB. The Programs are presented separately for each budget user in the Separate part of the Central budget (showing separate users and expenditures purposes by economic and program classification). Example: page 253, The Ministry of labor and social policy budget programs and subprograms. The Enacted Budget is available at: <http://finance.gov.mk/mk/node/4105>

061. Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.
- B. No, the Enacted Budget does not present revenue estimates by category.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: The revenue estimates by category are presented on pages 65 and 68 of the EB of Republic of Macedonia for 2014 (lines 71 and 72)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

062. Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?

- A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- B. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- C. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
- D. No, the Enacted Budget does not present individual sources of revenue.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: The individual sources of tax and non-tax revenues are shown on pages 65 and 68 of the EB of Republic of Macedonia for 2014 (lines 71 and 72)

Comments: Данок од доход, од добивка и од капитални добивки is at least three if not more individual taxes. Домашни даноци на стоки и услуги is at least 2 individual taxes. Глоби, судски и административни такси, Такси и надоместоци among other non-tax revenue needs to be further disaggregated. This is why B is the answer.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: Guidelines for public revenues classifications, page 2 - 7:

http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/Pravilnik_za_klasifikacija_na_prihodite.pdf Page 68 in the EB for 2014 (Central budget revenues). The tax revenues are not disaggregated in the budget. The Tax revenues are presented in 4 cumulative accounts: 711, 714, 715 and 718. These accounts are consisted of different tax revenues. For example: account item 711 named as: Taxes from income, profit and capital gains include two types of taxes i.e. income tax (7111) and profit tax (7112), which are not presented in the budget. The EB is available at:

<http://finance.gov.mk/files/BUDZET%202014%20FINALNA%20VERZIJA%2019.12.2013.pdf>

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

Revenues could be further disaggregated but when we compare the level of detail to other countries it merits a B answer (in coordination with IBP).

063. Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: The net new borrowing required during the budget year is shown on page 68 lines 75 and 76 The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year is shown on page 71 lines 45 and 49

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: a.

Comments: Not all the information provided by the researcher in its comment section refer to the key estimates of borrowings and debt and some of the information used in this section are not related to the key estimates. The researcher missed to mention the account 77 "securities selling" presented in the Revenue statement of the Central budget by items of the EB for 2014. While related to the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year he/she used the

item 49 from the Expenditure statement of the Central budget by items of the EB for 2014, which refer to the estimate amount of money allocated for covering the "loan principal". The following information should be used as supporting information: - amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year, page 68, items: 75 (domestic borrowings), 76 (external borrowings) and 77 (securities selling) - interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year, page 71, item 45.

064. What information is provided in the Citizens Budget? (The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

- A. The Citizens Budget provides information beyond the core elements.
- B. The Citizens Budget provides the core information.
- C. The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.
- D. The Citizens Budget is not published.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The Citizens Budget is not published.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

065. How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

- A. A Citizens Budget is disseminated widely through a combination of at least three different appropriate tools and media (such as the Internet, billboards, radio programs, newspapers, etc.).
- B. A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.
- C. A Citizens Budget is disseminated only by using one means of dissemination.
- D. A Citizens Budget is not published.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

066. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

A. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.

B. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.

C. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

D. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

067. Are "citizens" versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

- A.** A citizens version of budget documents is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit).
- B.** A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process.
- C.** A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least one stage of the budget process.
- D.** No citizens version of budget documents is published.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

068. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- A.** Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- B.** Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- C.** Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- D.** No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by any expenditure classification.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Monthly reports of the Central Government Budget Execution (Including Fund Budget) are based on the IMF methodology for government statistics (Government Finance Statistic 1986).

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The actual expenditures in the In-Year Reports are presented by economic classification.

069. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

- A. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- B. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- C. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- D. No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

070. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- A. Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- B. No, comparisons are not made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: In-Year Reports that are publicly available on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance compare only the total year expenditures from the Enacted Budget with the actual year-to-date expenditures.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

071. Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- A. Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.
- B. No, In-Year Reports do not present actual revenue by category.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: The revenues are shown by category: Tax sources (Даночни приходи и придонеси) and non-tax sources (Неданочни приходи)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

072. Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

- A. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for all revenue.
- B. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- C. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenue.
- D. No, In-Year Reports do not present individual sources of actual revenue.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: The revenues are shown by category: Tax sources (Даночни приходи и придонеси) and non-tax sources (Неданочни приходи)

Comments: While there are revenue line items that are clearly aggregated. Данок од доход, од добивка и од капитални добивки is at least three if not more individual taxes. Домашни даноци на стоки и услуги is at least 2 individual taxes. Глоби, судски и административни такси, Такси и надоместоци among other non-tax revenue needs to be further disaggregated. This is why B is the answer.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The In Year Report presents the individual sources of revenues in details, unlike EBP and EB. Still, not all individual sources of revenues are presented. Also the In Year Report presents the revenues in a different way from the EBP and the EB. The category "Taxes" in the EBP and the EB contains 4 cumulative categories of taxes (711, 714, 715 and 718). The category "Taxes" in the In Year Report contains 6 individual taxes (account 711 from the EBP and the EB in the In Year Report is segregated in 2 items - raw 5 and 6).

073. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- A. Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.
- B. No, comparisons are not made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: In-Year Reports that are publicly available on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance compare only the total year revenue from the Enacted Budget with the actual year-to-date revenues.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

074. Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?

- A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 33

Sources: Presented is only the interest payments on the outstanding debt (камати по надворешен долг)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The interest payments for the internal and external debt are only presented. The In Year Report is available at: <http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u12/Budget2013.pdf> (line 37,38 and 39)

075. Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.
- B. Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.
- C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- D. No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: These information are not presented in the IYR of Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

076. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

- A.** Yes, the estimates for the macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.
- B.** Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.
- C.** Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated forecast is not presented.
- D.** No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance. <http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

077. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

- A.** Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.
- B.** Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.
- C.** Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is not presented.
- D.** No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance.

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

078. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- A.** Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- B.** Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- C.** Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- D.** No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance.

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

079. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- A. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- B. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- C. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- D. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance.

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

080. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

- A. Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
- B. Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
- C. Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is not presented.
- D. No, revenue estimates have not been updated.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance.

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

081. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- A. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents revenue estimates by category.
- B. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance.

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

082. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present individual sources of revenue?

- A. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- B. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- C. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
- D. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance.

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

083. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?

- A.** Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on all of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- B.** Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on some of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- C.** Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, but information on the differences between the original and updated estimates is not presented.
- D.** No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: According to the Budget Law, the Ministry of Finance prepares and submit to the government of the RM a report with detailed analysis of budget execution. In addition, the Ministry has to submit an updated report on macroeconomic indicators and projected revenues, undertaken liabilities, and expenditures for the fiscal year. The report should be submitted by the 31st of July, at the latest, and should be published on the Internet site of the Ministry of Finance.

<http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/0.pdf> Budget Law (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Currently, such reports are not released to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

084. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

- A.** Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B.** Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all expenditures are presented.
- D.** No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures are not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Pages 4-5 and 10-11 in the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia

Comments: We answered B because in 2012 YER there are estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures but there is no narrative discussion.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Pages 10-11 in the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia (Central budget). YER available at: http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/ZA_OBJAVUVANJE_ZAVRSNA_2012.pdf

085. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- A.** Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- B.** Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- C.** Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- D.** No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Administrative expenditure classification on pages 12-14 Economic expenditure classification on pages 10-11 Functional expenditure classification on pages 15-17

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

086. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- A. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- B. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- C. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- D. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: This is shown on pages 18-27 in the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

087. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

- A. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all revenues are presented.
- D. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for revenues are not presented.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: This is shown on pages 2-3 and 6-7

Comments: We answered B because in 2012 YER there are estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues but there is no narrative discussion.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: This is shown on pages 6-7 (Central Budget).

088. Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- A.** Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.
- B.** No, the Year-End Report does not present revenue estimates by category.
- C.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: This is shown on pages 2-3 and 6-7 lines 71 and 72

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: This is shown on pages 6-7, lines 71 and 72 (Central Budget).

089. Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

- A.** Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- B.** Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- C.** Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
- D.** No, the Year-End Report does not present individual sources of revenue.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: This is shown on pages 2-3 and 6-7 lines 71 and 72

Comments: Данок од доход, од добивка и од капитални добивки is at least three if not more individual taxes. Домашни даноци на стоки и услуги is at least 2 individual taxes. Глоби, судски и административни такси, Такси и надоместоци among other non-tax revenue needs to be further disaggregated. This is why B is the answer.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: Guidelines for public revenues classifications, page 2 - 7:

http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/Pravilnik_za_klasifikacija_na_prihodite.pdf Page 6 and 7 from the YER for 2012 (Central budget revenues). The tax revenues are not dis-aggregated in the budget. The Tax revenues are presented in 8 cumulative accounts: 711 - 718. These accounts are consisted of different tax revenues. For example: account item 711 named as: Taxes from income, profit and capital gains include two types of taxes i.e. income tax (7111) and profit tax (7112), which are not presented in the budget. Not all revenue items presented in the YER are presented in the EBP or EB (or in the supplemental budget) as well. For example: accounts 712, 713, 716 and 717 are not included in EBP, EB and SB. The YER is available at: http://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u6/ZA_OBJAVUVANJE_ZAVRSNA_2012.pdf

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

Revenues could be further disaggregated but when we compare the level of detail to other countries it merits a B answer (in coordination with IBP).

090. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

- A. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B. Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.
- D. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year

and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Estimates are shown only for new net borrowing and whether it is domestic or external (page 6 lines 76 and 78); and interest payments of the outstanding debt (page 10 line 45) of the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: b.

Comments: The budget item provided by the researcher in its comment related to the "new net borrowing and whether it is domestic or external" is not correct. Namely, the researcher in its comment refers to item 76 (external borrowing) and 78 (income from loans). The item 78 does not refer to net new borrowing. This part should be changed as follows: - the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year, page 6, item 75 (domestic debt, including sub items 751 and 753) and item 76 (external debt, including sub items 761 and 762)

091. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: There are no macroeconomic forecast in the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

092. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

- A.** Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B.** Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented.
- D.** No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: These information are not shown in the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

093. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

- A.** Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B.** Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: These information are not shown in the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

094. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: These information are not shown in the YER for 2012 of Republic of Macedonia

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

095. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

- A.** Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- B.** Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- C.** Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented.
- D.** No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: The Executive's Budget Proposal presents information for: Health Insurance Fund (pages 30-31), Pension and Disability Insurance Fund of Macedonia (Pages 34-35) and Employment Service Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (pages 32-33).

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome in Year-End Report are presented on page 28 - 35, on the following order: Agency for sate roads (page 28 and 29); Health Insurance Fund (30 and 31); Pension and Disability Insurance Fund of Macedonia (page 34 and 35) and Employment Service Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (page 32 and 33).

096. Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

- A.** Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.
- B.** No, a financial statement is neither part of the Year-End Report nor released as a separate report.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: There is no financial statement as part of the Year-End Report or as a separate report.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

097. What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

- A. The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.
- B. The SAI has conducted two of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.
- C. The SAI has conducted one of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.
- D. The SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Made are financial audit (starting from page 9 articles 4.4, 4.5, 4.6 and 4.7) and compliance audit (page 8 article 4.2 and page 9 article 4.3) of the Budget. Audit to the Pension and Disability Insurance Fund (http://www.dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/2_Piom_Fond_penzisko_invalidsko_osiguruvanje_KOMPLET.pdf) : financial audit (starting from page 9 articles 4.2) and compliance audit (page 7 article 4.1, page 13 article 4.3) Audit to the Ministry of Health (http://www.dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/7_Ministerstvo_zdravstvo_Osnoven_budzet_631_19.pdf): financial audit (starting from page 7 articles 4.3) and compliance audit (page 6 article 4.2, page 8 article 4.4)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

IBP COMMENT

In the link: <http://www.dzr.mk/en/> they have left hand side Audit reports link. There one can find all three types of audit.

Thus, answer should be a.

098. What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

- A. All expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- B. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- C. Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- D. No expenditures have been audited.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Audited are some ministries and agencies. This is the link leading to the audit reports of these institutions-
<http://www.dzr.gov.mk/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=17&tabid=1140>

Comments: This is the percentage in the 2012 Audit Report because the Audit reports for 2013 are not released yet.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: b.

Comments: in 2012 90% out of the total expenditures of the Central Budget were subject of SA I's audit (this includes the expenditures from the Central Budget; budget from self financing activities; budget from borrowings and budget from donations). Namely in accordance to YER for 2012 in total 115.438.108.782 MKD were spent, while expenditures in amount of 103.700.364.000 MKD were audited. If we make an additional calculation based on the audited expenditures under the Central budget accounts only, then we can conclude that 98% of the expenditures for 2012 were audited.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We do not know how PR calculated this. Our calculation is based on the web page:

<http://www.dzr.gov.mk/DesktopDefault.aspx?tabindex=17&tabid=1140> and simple summation of the budgets of these budget users that are audited compared with the total budget for the proper year.

IBP COMMENT

After confirmation with the SAI, IBP decided to change the answer to B.

099. What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

- A. All extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- B. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- C. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- D. No extra-budgetary funds have been audited.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Audited are Health Insurance Fund

(http://www.dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/5_FZO_trezorsko_rabotenje_korisnici_KOMPLET.pdf), Pension and Disability Insurance Fund of Macedonia (http://www.dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/2_Piom_Fond_penzisko_invalidsko_osiguruvanje_KOMPLET.pdf) and Employment Service Agency of the Republic of Macedonia (http://www.dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/3_Agencija_za_vrabotuvanje_sledenje_preporaki.pdf)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

100. Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

- A. Yes, the annual Audit Report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.
- B. No, the annual Audit Report(s) does not include an executive summary.
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Pages 1-2 in the Audit report of the Budget of Republic of Macedonia for 2012

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

101. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- A. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- B. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- C. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- D. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

102. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

- A. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit recommendations.
- B. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on most audit recommendations.
- C. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on some audit recommendations.
- D. No, neither the SAI nor legislature reports on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: /

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Section 4. Strength of Oversight Institutions

103. Does the legislature have internal capacity to conduct budget analyses or use independent research capacity for such analyses?

- A.** Yes, there is a specialized budget research office/unit attached to the legislature, and it has sufficient staffing, resources, and analytical capacity to carry out its tasks.
- B.** Yes, there is a specialized budget research office, but its staffing and other resources, including adequate funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.
- C.** Yes, there are independent researchers outside the legislature that can perform budget analyses and the legislature takes advantage of this capacity, but there is no specialized office attached to the legislature.
- D.** No, the legislature has neither internal capacity nor access to independent research capacity for budget analyses.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia is in the process of establishing an internal institute for research and analyses.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

104. Does the legislature debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- A.** Yes, the legislature both debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approves recommendations for the budget, and the executive is obliged to reflect the legislature's recommendations in the budget.
- B.** Yes, the legislature both debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approves recommendations for the budget, but the executive is not obliged to reflect the legislature's recommendations in the budget.
- C.** Yes, the legislature debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but the legislature does not approve recommendations for the budget.
- D.** No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Rules of the Procedures of the Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia. Article 180.

<http://www.sobranie.mk/delovnik-na-sobranieto-na-republika-makedonija-precisten-tekst-sluzben-vesnik-na-republika-makedonija-broj-130-2010.nsp> In general, debates are very weak, without strong facts or evidence, politically colored.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: The Executives have the exclusive right to prepare and table the EBP. Usually they are submitting the EBP in the period from September to November and the legislature have the opportunity to debate on the proposal just 10 days in the Parliamentary commissions and 5 days on Plenary sessions. The Government of RM do not prepare Pre budget Statement. Also, the Executives are presenting the Fiscal strategy of RM after preparing the EBP.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We agree with the PR and changed the answer to D.

105. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

- A.** Yes, the executive holds consultations with a wide range of legislators.

- B.** Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
- C.** Yes, the executive holds consultations with only a limited number of legislators.
- D.** No, the executive does not consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The executive does not consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

106. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- A.** The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least three months before the start of the budget year.
- B.** The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
- C.** The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.
- D.** The legislature does not receive the Executive's Budget Proposal before the start of the budget year.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Law on Budgets. (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 4/2005; 4/2008; 103/2008; 156/2009, 95/2010 и 180/2011). Article 30. According the Law on Budgets, Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia must receive the Executive's Budget Proposal no later than the 15th of November of the current year.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: a.

Comments: According the Law on Budgets, Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia must receive the Executive's Budget

Proposal no later than 15th of November of the current year (Article 30). However this practice was changed in 2013 (Budget for 2014) and 2014 (Budget for 2015). The EBP was submitted to the legislature in September, which is different in comparisons to the previous years. As you can notice, the Government submits the EBP in the last two years prior to the legally determined deadline, which can be described as a positive practice. Even so, we have to emphasize that the Parliamentary Rulebook limits the time for discussion upon the EBP (10 days within the Parliamentary Commissions and 5 days on a plenary sessions).

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We change our answer to "a" to reflect the practice.

107. When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- A. The legislature approves the budget at least one month in advance of the start of the budget year.
- B. The legislature approves the budget less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year.
- C. The legislature approves the budget less than one month after the start of the budget year.
- D. The legislature approves the budget more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Law on Budgets. (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 4/2005; 4/2008; 103/2008; 156/2009, 95/2010 и 180/2011). Article 30 paragraph 3

Comments: The Budget for 2014 was passed on 20.12.2013. The budget year starts on 01.01.2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

108. Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- A. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.

- B.** Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, with some limitations.
- C.** Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but its authority is very limited.
- D.** No, the legislature does not have any authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 100

Sources: Rules of Procedure of the Parliament of Republic of Macedonia (<http://www.sobranie.mk/delovnik-na-sobranieto-na-republika-makedonija-precisten-tekst-sluzben-vesnik-na-republika-makedonija-broj-130-2010.nsp>): article 180 Law on Budgets. (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 4/2005; 4/2008; 103/2008; 156/2009, 95/2010 и 180/2011) (articles 29 and 30)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: b.

109. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

- A.** The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice.
- B.** The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- C.** The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.
- D.** The executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 100

Sources: Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia decides on reallocation among budget users of the central government and between funds. Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia, upon proposal by the Government of Macedonia, adopted amendments to the budget no later than November 15 in the current year.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Assembly of Republic of Macedonia decides for reallocations among budget users of the central government, as well as between the extra budgetary funds. Assembly of Republic of Macedonia, upon proposal by the Government of Macedonia, can adopt amendments to the budget no later than November 15 in the current year. The Executives do not need approval from the legislature for reallocation within the approved budgets to a certain extent. Namely, according to the Law on budgets article 33, each ministry can reallocate funds among it's own budget programs up to 5 million denars. The reallocations over 5 mil. must be approved by the Government. For reallocations among administrative users, approval from the legislators is mandatory.

110. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

- A.** The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units, and it does so in practice.
- B.** The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- C.** The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.
- D.** The executive shifts funds within administrative units without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia decides on reallocation among budget users of the central government and between funds. Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia, upon proposal by the Government of Macedonia, adopted amendments to the budget no later than November 15 in the current year. Article 33 , Article 36 in the Law on Budget

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: The Executives do not need approval from the legislature for reallocation within the approved budgets. According to the Law on budgets article 33, each ministry can reallocate funds among its budget programs up to 5 million denars. The reallocations over 5 mil. must be approved by the Government. With the reallocation the program budgets should not be reduced more than 20% and the salaries should not be increased more than 10%. For reallocations among administrative users, approval from the legislators is mandatory.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

if it is within one ministry then this is only approved by the government (or minfin) and in that case answer is under "d". Our understanding is the second thus, we choose the answer "d".

111. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

- A.** The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and it does so in practice.
- B.** The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- C.** The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, but in practice the executive spends these funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.
- D.** The executive spends excess revenues without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: If revenues are higher than projected by a maximum of 5 percent, the Ministry of Finance can use them to pay interests and debts. In the case when revenues are higher than the projected by 6 percent or more, a supplementary budget must be submitted for approval by the Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia (legislator). Article 36 from the Law on Budgets ([file:///C:/Users/User/Downloads/precisten_tekst_1%20\(3\).pdf](file:///C:/Users/User/Downloads/precisten_tekst_1%20(3).pdf))

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: According to the Law on Budgets (article 36, paragraph 2) the Minister of finance and the Mayor may use the

excess revenues for paying additional payments of the current debts and their interest payments.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We agree with PR. We change to answer "d". Note that this spending is earmarked by law to paying debt and interest.

112. When was the most recent supplemental budget approved?

- A. The most recent supplemental budget was approved before the funds were expended.
- B. The most recent supplemental budget was approved after the funds were expended, or the executive implemented the supplemental budget without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Law on Budgets. (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Article 36. If during the execution of the budget, Ministry of Finance estimates that necessitate significant reallocations of the approved funds, or if the realization of revenues and other inflows significantly deviate from the plan, a supplementary budget should be suggested to the Government of the Republic of Macedonia. Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia, upon the proposal of the Government of Macedonia, adopted amendments to the budget no later than November 15 of the current year.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The most recent supplemental budget was approved on November 5th 2013. The SB is available at:

<http://www.slv.esnik.com.mk/Issues/d52d3265aaa14a1fba058acdda760773.pdf>

113. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

- A. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds, and it does so in practice.
- B. The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.

- C.** The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds, but in practice the executive spends these funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.
- D.** The executive spends contingency funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 0

Sources: Law on Budgets. (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Article 48. The Government of Macedonia is approving the usage of contingency funds without the Assembly's approval.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

114. Does a committee of the legislature hold public hearings to review and scrutinize Audit Reports?

- A.** Yes, a committee holds public hearings to review and scrutinize a wide range of Audit Reports.
- B.** Yes, a committee holds public hearings to review and scrutinize the main Audit Reports.
- C.** Yes, a committee holds public hearings to review and scrutinize a small number of Audit Reports.
- D.** No, a committee does not hold public hearings to review and scrutinize Audit Reports.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 33

Sources: Law on Budgets. (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia 64/05, 04/08, 103/08, 156/09 and 95/10). Article 52. Finances and Budget Committee of the Assembly of the Republic of Macedonia it is not obliged to scrutinize all audit reports.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

- A. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- B. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
- C. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
- D. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Law on State Audit Article 9 states that SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake:
http://dzt.gov.mk/Uploads/NOV_Zakon_dzavna_revizija.pdf

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Law on State Audit , Articles 9 and 22 are stating that SAI has full discretion to decide upon undertaking the audits. The Law is available at: http://dzt.gov.mk/Uploads/NOV_Zakon_dzavna_revizija.pdf

116. Has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) established a monitoring system to provide on-going, independent evaluations of its audit processes (a quality assurance system)?

- A. Yes, the SAI has established a quality assurance system, and both a sample of completed audits are reviewed annually and the findings of these reviews are made available to the public.
- B. Yes, the SAI has established a quality assurance system, but either a sample of completed audits are not reviewed annually or the findings of these reviews are not made available to the public.
- C. Yes, the SAI has established a quality assurance system, but neither a sample of completed audits are reviewed annually nor are the findings of these reviews made available to the public.
- D. No, the SAI has not established a quality assurance system.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: <http://www.dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/Peer%20Review%20MKD.pdf>

Comments: The SAI makes Peer review of its work made by the Court of Audit of the Federal Republic of Germany and publishes it on its official web site that way making it available to the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

117. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

A. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.

B. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Law on State Audit (Article 7): http://dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/NOV_Zakon_dzavna_revizija.pdf

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The Head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office only with decision by the legislators according to the Law on State Audit (Article 4). The Law is available at:

http://dzr.gov.mk/Uploads/NOV_Zakon_dzavna_revizija.pdf

118. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

A. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is

broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

B. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

C. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

D. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Law on State Audit (Article 12): http://dzt.gov.mk/Uploads/NOV_Zakon_dzavna_revizija.pdf

Comments: Article 12 of the Law on State Audit states that the funds for the operation of the SAI are determined by the Assembly of Republic of Macedonia on the previous proposal of the SAI; the budget of the SAI is prepared within established annual limits determined in accordance with the fiscal strategy and an integral part of the Budget of Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Section 5. Public Engagement in the Budget Process

119. Does the executive make available to the public clear (accessible, nontechnical) definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?

A. Yes, clear definitions of all key budget terms are provided.

B. Yes, definitions are provided for all key budget terms, but they are not always clear.

C. Yes, definitions are provided for some but not all key budget terms.

D. No, definitions are not provided.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Definitions of terms used in the budget and other documents are publicly available in the Law on Budget of Republic of Macedonia Articles 2, 3 and 13

Comments: The answer is A because the Law on Budget is available to the public, and also if someone wants to know what for example debt means, if doesn't know that there is Law on Budget, he/she can google it and the definition that is in the Law will come out. On the other hand, the definitions are clear and include all terms that are used in the EB and EBP.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: b.

Comments: The definitions that are presented in the Law on Budgets are too much technical and not understandable for the citizens. Except the Law on Budget there are no publicly available definitions on the terms used in the budgets. The Budget or any other related budget document does not contain Glossary.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

The question is asking whether the MOF has developed user-friendly definitions of public financial terms then the answer at best should be under "b". We agree.

120. Is the executive formally required to engage with the public during the formulation and execution phases of the budget process?

- A.** A law, a regulation, or a formal procedural obligation requires the executive to engage with the public during both the formulation and execution phases of the budget process.
- B.** A law, a regulation, or a formal procedural obligation requires the executive to engage with the public during either the formulation or the execution phase of the budget process but not both.
- C.** There is no formal requirement for the executive to engage with the public during either the formulation or the execution phase of the budget process, but informal procedures exist to enable the public to engage with the executive during the formulation or execution phase of the budget process or during both phases.
- D.** There is no formal requirement and the executive does not engage with the public during the budget process.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Public is only informed, without any opportunities to influence budget formulation and execution.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

121. When the executive engages with the public during the budget formulation process, does it articulate what it hopes to achieve from the engagement and provide other information far enough in advance so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

- A.** The executive provides sufficient information (including what it hopes to achieve from its engagement with the public) in advance of the engagement.
- B.** The executive provides information to the public, but it is either insufficient or is not provided in advance of the engagement.
- C.** The executive provides information to the public, but it is neither sufficient nor provided in advance of the engagement.
- D.** The executive does not provide information, or does not engage with the public during the budget process.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Civil sector is not part of the budget process in the Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

122. When the executive engages with the public during the budget execution process, does it articulate what it hopes to achieve from the engagement and provide other information far enough in advance so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

- A.** The executive provides sufficient information (including what it hopes to achieve from its engagement with the public)

in advance of the engagement.

- B.** The executive provides information to the public, but it is either insufficient or is not provided in advance of the engagement.
- C.** The executive provides information to the public, but it is neither sufficient nor provided in advance of the engagement.
- D.** The executive does not provide information, or does not engage with the public during the budget process.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Civil sector is not part of the budget process in the Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

123. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities?

- A.** Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- B.** Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.
- C.** Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
- D.** No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Civil sector is not part of the budget process in the Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

124. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution?

- A.** Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- B.** Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.
- C.** Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
- D.** No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The civil sector is not part of the budget process in Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

125. Does the executive provide formal, detailed feedback to the public on how its inputs have been used to develop budget plans and improve budget execution?

- A.** Yes, the executive issues reports on the inputs it received from the public and provides detailed feedback on how these inputs have been used.
- B.** Yes, the executive issues reports on the inputs it received from the public, but provides only limited feedback on how these inputs have been used.
- C.** Yes, the executive issues reports on the inputs it received from the public, but provides no feedback on how these inputs have been used.
- D.** No, the executive does not issue reports on the inputs it received from the public or provide feedback on how these inputs have been used.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 0

Sources: The civil sector is not part of the budget process in Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

126. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

- A.** Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
- B.** Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
- C.** Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
- D.** No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 0

Sources: Macroeconomic and fiscal framework are developed by the Government of Republic of Macedonia.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

127. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (i.e., ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

- A. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of a wide range of administrative units.
- B. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of the main administrative units.
- C. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of a small number of administrative units.
- D. No, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are not held on the budgets of administrative units.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR



Score: 0

Sources: Public hearings are not held.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

128. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (i.e., ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

- A. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of a wide range of administrative units.
- B. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of some administrative units.
- C. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of a small number of administrative units.
- D. No, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are not held on the budgets of administrative units.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: It is very rare that testimony from the public is heard during committee hearings.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: In Macedonia there are no public hearings held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

It happened twice. Once in 2009 at the finance and budget committee and (in accordance with Parliament's sources) once at committee for equal gender opportunity in 2010. But We have no info on other such cases. thus, we agree with PR and we choose "d".

129. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings on the budget release reports to the public on these hearings?

- A. Yes, the committees release reports, which include all written and spoken testimony presented at the hearings.
- B. Yes, the committees release reports, which include most testimony presented at the hearings.
- C. Yes, the committees release reports, but they include only some testimony presented at the hearings.
- D. No, the committees do not release reports, or do not hold public hearings.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Reports of the discussions are published on the Assembly's website: <http://www.sobranie.mk/javni-diskusii.nsp>
Reports are in the form of a summary and some details are excluded.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: The public hearings on Budget are not held in Macedonia.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

We changed to "d".

130. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program (by identifying the agencies, programs, or projects that should be audited)?

- A.** Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- B.** Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program; while these mechanisms are accessible, they are not widely used by the public.
- C.** Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
- D.** No, the SAI does not have formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: State Audit Office is not obliged to consult the public about the audit process and does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

131. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

- A.** Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- B.** Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations; while these mechanisms are accessible, they are not widely used by the public.
- C.** Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations, but these

mechanisms are not accessible.

D. No, the SAI does not have formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: State Audit Office is not obliged to consult the public about the audit process and does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

132. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain any communication with the public regarding its Audit Reports beyond simply making these reports publicly available?

A. Yes, in addition to publishing Audit Reports, the SAI maintains other mechanisms of communication to make the public aware of audit findings (such as maintaining an office that regularly conducts outreach activities to publicize previously released audit findings).

B. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public beyond publishing Audit Reports.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

B.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

133. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide formal, detailed feedback to the public on how their inputs have been used to determine its audit program or in Audit Reports?

- A.** Yes, the SAI issues reports on the inputs it received from the public and provides detailed feedback on how these inputs have been used.
- B.** Yes, the SAI issues reports on the inputs it received from the public but provides only limited feedback on how these inputs have been used.
- C.** Yes, the SAI issues reports on the inputs it received from the public but provides no feedback on how these inputs have been used.
- D.** No, the SAI does not issue reports on the inputs it received from the public through public consultations.
- E.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Macedonia, FYR

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Not produced.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.